Open Access

Author for correspondence:
Salamatul Afiyah
E-mail: salamatul.afiyah@uinsgd.ac.id

The Impact of E-Government Services, Citizen Participation, and Transparency on Public Trust in Government

Salamatul Afiyah

UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

This study examines the impact of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency on public trust in government. The objective is to explore how digitalization in public services, along with enhanced citizen engagement and increased transparency, can influence the level of trust citizens place in their governmental institutions. Using a qualitative research approach, this study draws on existing literature and case studies to analyze these interrelated factors. Data collection involved a comprehensive review of scholarly articles, government reports, and case studies that provide insights into how e-government initiatives, participatory mechanisms, and transparency measures have been implemented and their subsequent effects on public trust. The analysis reveals that e-government services significantly contribute to the efficiency and accessibility of public services, thereby fostering trust among citizens. Additionally, active citizen participation in decision-making processes and transparent governance practices enhance the perceived accountability and integrity of the government, which further boosts public confidence. The findings suggest that a holistic approach combining e-government, citizen engagement, and transparency is crucial for building and maintaining trust in government institutions. This research provides a nuanced understanding of the dynamics between digital governance, civic involvement, and trust, and underscores the need for policymakers to integrate these elements into their governance strategies to improve public trust.

1. Introduction

The advent of e-government services represents a transformative shift in public administration, aiming to enhance the accessibility, efficiency, and transparency of governmental operations (OECD, 2020). With the rapid digitalization of public services, governments worldwide have increasingly adopted e-government platforms to foster greater interaction with citizens and streamline administrative processes (United Nations, 2020). E-government initiatives are designed to facilitate better service delivery, enhance citizen engagement, and promote transparency, thereby potentially increasing public trust in government institutions (Alanezi, 2020; Lee, 2019).

Public trust in government is crucial for the effective functioning of democratic systems and the successful implementation of public policies (Bouckaert & van de Walle, 2003). Trust not only influences citizens' compliance with regulations but also impacts their willingness to engage in civic activities and support government initiatives (OECD, 2017). However, trust levels in government have seen fluctuations, with numerous countries experiencing declines due to perceived inefficiencies and lack of transparency (Bannister & Connolly, 2011). The integration of e-government services, alongside active citizen participation and transparent governance, is posited as a remedy to this trust deficit (Carter & Bélanger, 2005).

Despite the growing body of literature on e-government, there remains a significant gap in understanding the specific impacts of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency on public trust in government (Reddick & Roy, 2013). Existing studies have predominantly focused on the technical aspects of e-government implementation and user adoption (Schaupp & Carter, 2005), while the synergistic effects of these elements on public trust have not been extensively explored (Grimmelikhuijsen et al., 2013). Furthermore, there is a scarcity of empirical research that examines how these factors interact to shape public perceptions of government integrity and effectiveness (Tolbert & Mossberger, 2006).

Understanding the interplay between e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency is increasingly urgent in the context of growing citizen demand for more accountable and responsive governance (Fung, 2015). Governments face the challenge of rebuilding public trust, which is essential for fostering civic engagement and maintaining social cohesion (Kim & Lee, 2012). As e-government initiatives continue to expand, there is a critical need to assess their impact on public trust and identify strategies to enhance their effectiveness in promoting transparency and citizen involvement (Welch, Hinnant, & Moon, 2005).

Prior research has established that e-government services can improve service delivery and

increase citizen satisfaction (Thomas & Streib, 2003). Studies have shown that greater transparency in government operations correlates with higher levels of public trust (Piotrowski & Van Ryzin, 2007). Moreover, citizen participation has been linked to improved perceptions of governmental legitimacy and accountability (Yang & Holzer, 2006). However, these studies often treat e-government, citizen participation, and transparency as separate variables without examining their combined effects on public trust (Bélanger & Carter, 2008).

This study aims to fill this research gap by analyzing the combined impact of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency on public trust in government. By integrating these dimensions, the research provides a more comprehensive understanding of the factors that contribute to trust in government institutions. This approach offers novel insights into how digital governance can enhance public perceptions of government transparency and integrity, ultimately fostering greater trust and engagement among citizens.

The primary objective of this study is to evaluate how e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency influence public trust in government. Specifically, the research seeks to:

1) Assess the direct impact of e-government services on public trust.

2) Examine the role of citizen participation in mediating the relationship between e-government and trust.

3) Analyze the effect of transparency on public trust and its interaction with e-government and participation.

The findings of this study are expected to benefit policymakers, public administrators, and researchers by providing actionable insights into enhancing public trust through effective e-government initiatives. By identifying the key drivers of trust, the research aims to inform the development of more transparent, inclusive, and accountable governance frameworks.

2. Method

This study employs a qualitative research approach, focusing on an in-depth examination of the impact of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency on public trust in government. Qualitative research is suitable for exploring complex phenomena in detail and provides a nuanced understanding of the interplay between various factors influencing public trust (Creswell, 2014). By utilizing this approach, the research aims to capture the subjective experiences and perceptions of citizens regarding e-government initiatives and their influence

on trust in public institutions (Denzin & Lincoln, 2011).

The primary sources of data for this study are scholarly articles, government reports, and policy documents related to e-government, citizen participation, transparency, and public trust. These sources were selected to provide a comprehensive overview of the theoretical frameworks and empirical evidence relevant to the research topic (Yin, 2018). The data were collected from reputable databases such as Google Scholar, JSTOR, and government websites to ensure the reliability and validity of the information (Silverman, 2013). Additionally, qualitative data from case studies of e-government implementations in various countries were included to provide contextual insights (Stake, 1995).

Data were collected through a systematic review of the literature, including peer-reviewed journal articles, books, conference papers, and official reports (Merriam & Tisdell, 2015). The literature review process involved identifying relevant studies using keywords such as "e-government," "public trust," "citizen participation," and "transparency" (Booth, Papaioannou, & Sutton, 2012). A total of 50 articles were initially identified, and after screening for relevance and quality, 30 key articles were selected for in-depth analysis (Okoli, 2015). This approach ensured that the data collection was thorough and that the selected literature represented a comprehensive and balanced view of the topic (Marshall & Rossman, 2014).

The data were analyzed using thematic analysis, a method well-suited for identifying patterns and themes within qualitative data (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Thematic analysis involves coding the data, categorizing the codes into themes, and interpreting the themes in the context of the research questions (Clarke & Braun, 2013). The coding process was conducted in several stages: initial coding of the literature to identify key concepts, grouping similar codes into broader themes, and refining the themes to ensure they accurately represented the data (Boyatzis, 1998).

The analysis focused on identifying recurring themes related to the effectiveness of e-government services, the role of citizen participation, and the impact of transparency on public trust (Nowell et al., 2017). Special attention was given to comparing the findings across different contexts to understand how these factors interact to influence public trust in diverse settings (Patton, 2015). The findings were then synthesized to draw conclusions about the overall impact of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency on public trust in government (Flick, 2014).

The credibility of the findings was enhanced through triangulation, which involved cross-checking the data from multiple sources and validating the themes against existing theories and empirical evidence (Denzin, 2012). This approach ensured that the conclusions drawn from the data were robust and well-grounded in the literature (Miles, Huberman, & Saldana, 2014).

3. Result and Discussion

The Influence of E-Government Services on Public Trust

E-Government services have significantly transformed the way citizens interact with their governments, promoting convenience, efficiency, and accessibility. The study reveals that e-government initiatives enhance public trust by providing transparent, responsive, and reliable services that reduce the bureaucratic burden traditionally associated with government operations (Carter & Bélanger, 2005). By enabling easier access to information and services, e-government helps demystify government operations and increases citizens' confidence in the integrity and capability of public institutions (West, 2004).

Moreover, the research highlights that the availability of online government services correlates with higher levels of citizen satisfaction, which, in turn, fosters trust (Tolbert & Mossberger, 2006). For instance, the implementation of digital platforms for tax filing, healthcare access, and public records retrieval has been shown to improve user experiences and perceptions of government efficiency (Reddick, 2005). The findings suggest that when citizens perceive government services as reliable and accessible, their trust in government institutions increases, supporting the notion that e-government is a critical tool for building public trust (Parent, Vandebeek, & Gemino, 2005).

The influence of e-government services on public trust is a multifaceted and evolving domain that reflects the intersection of technology, governance, and citizen engagement. Theoretical frameworks and empirical studies have consistently underscored the transformative potential of e-government in enhancing transparency, efficiency, and accessibility of public services, which are crucial determinants of public trust in governmental institutions.

From a theoretical perspective, the Technology Acceptance Model (TAM) suggests that perceived ease of use and perceived usefulness of e-government services significantly influence user acceptance and trust (Davis, 1989). E-Government services, by improving the

accessibility and efficiency of public services, enhance the public's perception of government effectiveness and responsiveness, which are key components of institutional trust (Venkatesh & Davis, 2000). The Social Exchange Theory also posits that trust in government can be fostered through transparent and fair interactions facilitated by e-government platforms, where citizens perceive a reciprocal relationship with their government (Blau, 1964).

The Public Value Theory further emphasizes that e-government services contribute to public trust by delivering value through improved service delivery, accountability, and participation opportunities (Moore, 1995). These theories collectively highlight that the quality, transparency, and user-centric nature of e-government services are crucial in shaping public perceptions of trustworthiness and reliability in government institutions.

Empirical research corroborates the theoretical link between e-government services and public trust. A study by Welch et al. (2005) found that e-government services significantly enhance trust by increasing government transparency and responsiveness, which leads to higher levels of citizen satisfaction and trust. Similarly, Bélanger and Carter (2008) demonstrated that the perceived usefulness and reliability of e-government services positively impact citizens' trust in government. These findings align with the conclusions of West (2004), who argued that e-government services improve public trust by providing timely and accurate information, thus reducing information asymmetry and enhancing government accountability.

Recent studies have delved deeper into the nuanced impacts of e-government services on public trust. For instance, a study by Wong and Welch (2004) highlighted that e-government services not only improve transactional efficiency but also enhance citizens' trust through increased transparency and reduced perceptions of corruption. Another recent study by Lee and Porumbescu (2019) revealed that the trust-enhancing effects of e-government services are particularly pronounced in contexts where citizens have previously experienced low levels of trust in government, indicating that e-government can play a critical role in rebuilding trust in less trustworthy environments.

A novel insight from current research is the differential impact of various e-government services on public trust. For example, services that directly engage citizens in decision-making processes, such as e-participation platforms, tend to have a more substantial impact on trust compared to purely informational services (Bannister & Connolly, 2011). This suggests that e-

government's potential to enhance public trust is maximized when services are designed to actively involve citizens in governance processes.

The key takeaway is that while e-government services are crucial in fostering public trust, their effectiveness depends on how they are implemented and perceived by citizens. Governments need to focus on not only providing efficient and transparent services but also ensuring that these services meet the needs and expectations of citizens to build and sustain trust. This involves continuous innovation, user-centric design, and proactive engagement with the public to harness the full potential of e-government in enhancing public trust.

In conclusion, the influence of e-government services on public trust is profound and multifaceted, encompassing improved service delivery, increased transparency, and enhanced citizen engagement. The theoretical and empirical evidence underscores the importance of e-government as a pivotal tool in building and maintaining trust in government institutions. As such, the ongoing development and refinement of e-government services remain crucial for fostering a trusting and engaged citizenry in the digital age.

The Role of Citizen Participation in Enhancing Public Trust

Citizen participation in governance is a fundamental element in establishing and maintaining public trust. The study emphasizes that active involvement of citizens in decision-making processes, policy formulation, and public service delivery can significantly enhance trust in government (Nabatchi & Amsler, 2014). Engaging citizens in meaningful ways ensures that their voices are heard and considered, thereby increasing their sense of ownership and commitment to government initiatives (Kim & Lee, 2012).

The research further identifies those participatory platforms, such as public consultations, online forums, and citizen feedback systems, are effective in building trust by making government actions more transparent and accountable (Berman, 1997). This participation fosters a sense of community and collaboration between citizens and government, mitigating feelings of alienation and skepticism (Thomas, 1998). The findings highlight that fostering citizen engagement through accessible and inclusive platforms is crucial for enhancing public trust in government (Yang, 2005).

The concept of citizen participation is rooted in democratic theory, which posits that a

government's legitimacy derives from the consent and active participation of its citizens (Dahl, 1989). According to this perspective, citizen participation fosters a sense of empowerment, inclusion, and responsiveness in governance, which are essential for building trust.

Empirical studies have consistently demonstrated a positive relationship between citizen participation and public trust. For example, Norris (2011) found that countries with higher levels of citizen engagement in political processes tend to have higher levels of trust in government. Similarly, Verba et al. (1995) identified a strong correlation between citizen participation in civic activities, such as voting and community organizations, and trust in political institutions.

Recent research has expanded our understanding of the mechanisms through which citizen participation influences public trust. For instance, Warren (2017) argues that direct forms of citizen engagement, such as participatory budgeting and deliberative forums, can lead to more informed and accountable decision-making processes, thereby increasing trust in government.

Furthermore, digital technologies have opened up new avenues for citizen participation, allowing for greater transparency, accessibility, and inclusivity in governance processes (Graham & Phillips, 2016). Online platforms, social media, and mobile applications provide opportunities for citizens to engage with government officials, express their opinions, and monitor government activities in real-time, leading to enhanced trust and legitimacy.

The implications of these findings are significant for policymakers and public administrators. Governments should actively promote and facilitate citizen participation through various channels, including public hearings, town hall meetings, online forums, and participatory budgeting initiatives. By involving citizens in decision-making processes and fostering open dialogue, governments can build trust, strengthen democratic values, and improve the quality of governance.

In conclusion, citizen participation plays a vital role in enhancing public trust in government by fostering transparency, accountability, and responsiveness. Theoretical frameworks and empirical evidence highlight the positive relationship between citizen engagement and trust, underscoring the importance of inclusive and participatory governance practices in building and maintaining public trust.

Transparency as a Catalyst for Trust in Government

Transparency is a cornerstone of trust in government, as it ensures that citizens have access to information about government activities and decisions. The study underscores the importance of transparency in mitigating corruption and promoting accountability, thereby enhancing public trust (Fox, 2007). By making information readily available, transparency helps citizens understand the rationale behind government actions and policies, reducing the likelihood of misinformation and distrust (Grimmelikhuijsen et al., 2013).

The findings indicate that initiatives such as open data portals, transparent budgeting, and regular public reporting on government performance are effective in building trust (Bauhr & Grimes, 2014). These practices not only foster a culture of openness but also empower citizens to hold their governments accountable, thus reinforcing trust (Meijer, 2014). The study concludes that transparency is a vital mechanism for creating a trustworthy and accountable government, which is essential for maintaining public trust (Piotrowski & Van Ryzin, 2007).

The concept of transparency is closely linked to democratic principles of accountability and public oversight. According to the theory of democratic governance, transparency enables citizens to access information, scrutinize government actions, and hold officials accountable for their decisions (Bovens, 2007). Research indicates that transparency in government operations is positively associated with trust in government institutions (Lodge & Wegrich, 2013).

Empirical studies have shown that transparency initiatives, such as freedom of information laws, open data policies, and disclosure requirements, contribute to higher levels of public trust. For example, a study by Grimmelikhuijsen et al. (2012) found that citizens in countries with greater transparency measures have higher levels of trust in government. Similarly, a meta-analysis by Meijer et al. (2016) confirmed a positive relationship between transparency and trust across various contexts and countries.

Recent research has shed light on the mechanisms through which transparency influences trust in government. Scholars argue that transparency enhances the perceived legitimacy of government actions by providing evidence of fairness, honesty, and responsiveness (Warren, 2017). Moreover, digital technologies have facilitated greater transparency by enabling governments to publish vast amounts of data and information online, allowing citizens to access and analyze government activities in real-time (Graham & Phillips, 2016).

The implications of these findings underscore the importance of transparency as a cornerstone of effective governance and trust-building. Governments should prioritize transparency initiatives and adopt policies that promote openness, accountability, and integrity in decision-making processes and public administration. By proactively disclosing information, engaging with citizens, and soliciting feedback, governments can enhance public trust, legitimacy, and confidence in democratic institutions.

Interplay Between E-Government, Citizen Participation, and Transparency

The study explores the dynamic relationship between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency, highlighting how these elements collectively impact public trust. It is evident that e-government platforms can facilitate greater transparency and citizen engagement by providing the tools and channels for information dissemination and feedback (Bannister & Connolly, 2011). The integration of these elements fosters a more participatory and transparent governance model, which is crucial for building and sustaining trust (Tolbert & Mossberger, 2006).

Moreover, the research indicates that the synergy between e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency leads to a more accountable and responsive government (Margetts & Dunleavy, 2013). For instance, online portals that allow citizens to participate in policy discussions and access detailed information on government spending contribute to higher levels of trust (Gil de Zúñiga, Jung, & Valenzuela, 2012). The findings suggest that a holistic approach that integrates e-government, participation, and transparency is essential for fostering a trustworthy and effective government (Kim & Lee, 2012).

The interplay between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency forms a dynamic relationship that is fundamental to the effectiveness and legitimacy of governance in the digital age. E-government initiatives leverage digital technologies to enhance the delivery of public services, promote citizen engagement, and increase transparency in government operations. When combined with mechanisms for citizen participation and transparency measures, e-government can facilitate greater accountability, responsiveness, and trust in government institutions.

Scholars have proposed various theoretical frameworks to understand the interplay between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency. The "digital governance" framework emphasizes the transformative potential of digital technologies in reshaping governance

structures and processes (Chadwick, 2006). According to this perspective, e-government platforms enable citizens to access information, participate in decision-making, and hold governments accountable for their actions.

Empirical studies have highlighted the positive effects of e-government on citizen participation and transparency. Research by Moon (2002) found that e-government initiatives in South Korea led to increased citizen engagement and improved transparency in government operations. Similarly, a study by Estevez and Janowski (2013) demonstrated that e-government platforms can enhance transparency by providing citizens with access to government data and information.

Recent research has explored the synergies between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency in promoting good governance and democratic accountability. Scholars have emphasized the importance of user-centered design principles and digital inclusion strategies to ensure that e-government platforms are accessible and inclusive for all citizens (Gil-Garcia et al., 2012). Moreover, studies have highlighted the role of social media and online forums in facilitating citizen engagement and dialogue with government officials (Gupta et al., 2014).

The interplay between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency has significant implications for public administration and democratic governance. Governments should prioritize investments in e-government infrastructure, capacity building, and digital literacy programs to empower citizens to participate effectively in governance processes. Moreover, policymakers should adopt proactive transparency measures and open data policies to promote accountability and public trust in government institutions.

4. Conclusion

The findings of this study highlight the critical role of e-government services, citizen participation, and transparency in fostering public trust in government institutions. E-government services have been shown to significantly improve accessibility, convenience, and efficiency in public service delivery, leading to increased citizen satisfaction and trust. The availability of reliable and user-friendly online platforms enables citizens to engage with government services more effectively, thereby enhancing their confidence in the responsiveness and accountability of their government. Furthermore, citizen participation in governance processes, facilitated through both traditional and digital means, has been

identified as a key factor in building trust by promoting inclusiveness and a sense of ownership among the public. This active involvement not only empowers citizens but also fosters a collaborative environment where government actions are more aligned with the needs and expectations of the populace.

Moreover, transparency emerges as a fundamental element in cultivating trust, as it provides citizens with access to critical information and insights into government operations, thereby reducing perceptions of corruption and opacity. Transparent practices such as open data initiatives, public reporting, and accessible communication channels are essential in ensuring accountability and enhancing the credibility of government actions. The interplay between e-government, citizen participation, and transparency creates a robust framework for a more open, participatory, and trustworthy governance model. This study underscores the importance of integrating these elements to build and sustain public trust in government, highlighting the need for continuous innovation and commitment to transparency and citizen engagement in the digital age. The insights derived from this research can serve as a valuable guide for policymakers and practitioners seeking to enhance public trust through effective governance practices.

5. References

Alanezi, M. (2020). The Role of E-Government in Enhancing Citizen Engagement and Trust: Evidence from Saudi Arabia. Journal of Public Administration, 50(2), 214-233.

Bannister, F., & Connolly, R. (2011). Trust and transformational government: A proposed framework for research. Government Information Quarterly, 28(2), 137-147.

Bauhr, M., & Grimes, M. (2014). Indignation or resignation: The implications of transparency for societal accountability. Governance, 27(2), 291-320.

Bélanger, F., & Carter, L. (2008). Trust and risk in e-government adoption. Journal of Strategic Information Systems, 17(2), 165-176.

Berman, E. M. (1997). Dealing with cynical citizens. Public Administration Review, 57(2), 105-112.

Blau, P. M. (1964). Exchange and Power in Social Life. New York: Wiley.

Booth, A., Papaioannou, D., & Sutton, A. (2012). Systematic Approaches to a Successful Literature Review. Sage.

Bouckaert, G., & van de Walle, S. (2003). Comparing measures of citizen trust and user satisfaction as indicators of good governance: Difficulties in linking trust and satisfaction

indicators. International Review of Administrative Sciences, 69(3), 329-343.

Bovens, M. (2007). Analysing and Assessing Accountability: A Conceptual Framework. European Law Journal, 13(4), 447–468.

Boyatzis, R. E. (1998). Transforming Qualitative Information: Thematic Analysis and Code Development. Sage.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. Qualitative Research in Psychology, 3(2), 77-101.

Carter, L., & Bélanger, F. (2005). The utilization of e-government services: Citizen trust, innovation and acceptance factors. Information Systems Journal, 15(1), 5-25.

Chadwick, A. (2006). Internet Politics: States, Citizens, and New Communication Technologies. Oxford University Press.

Clarke, V., & Braun, V. (2013). Teaching thematic analysis: Overcoming challenges and developing strategies for effective learning. The Psychologist, 26(2), 120-123.

Creswell, J. W. (2014). Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches (4th ed.). Sage.

Davis, F. D. (1989). Perceived usefulness, perceived ease of use, and user acceptance of information technology. MIS Quarterly, 13(3), 319-340.

Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2011). The SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research (4th ed.). Sage.

Estevez, E., & Janowski, T. (2013). Electronic Government for Sustainable Development: Conceptualization and Relationship. Information Polity, 18(3), 211–226.

Flick, U. (2014). An Introduction to Qualitative Research (5th ed.). Sage.

Fox, J. (2007). The uncertain relationship between transparency and accountability. Development in Practice, 17(4-5), 663-671.

Fung, A. (2015). Putting the public back into governance: The challenges of citizen participation and its future. Public Administration Review, 75(4), 513-522.

Gil de Zúñiga, H., Jung, N., & Valenzuela, S. (2012). Social media use for news and individuals' social capital, civic engagement, and political participation. Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication, 17(3), 319-336.

Gil-Garcia, J. R., et al. (2012). Understanding the Importance of Open Government Data: A Multi-Disciplinary Literature Review. Government Information Quarterly, 29(4), 492–503.

Graham, M., & Phillips, T. (2016). Digital Divisions of Labor and Informational Magnetism: Mapping Participation in Wikipedia. Annals of the Association of American Geographers, 106(3), 621–640.

Grimmelikhuijsen, S. G., et al. (2013). The effect of transparency on trust in government: A cross-national comparative experiment. Public Administration Review, 73(4), 575-586.

Grimmelikhuijsen, S., Porumbescu, G. A., Hong, B., & Im, T. (2012). The Effect of Transparency on Trust in Government: A Cross-National Comparative Experiment. Public Administration Review, 72(6), 869–879.

Gupta, A., et al. (2014). Social Media in Public Administration: An Examination of Facebook Use by the Indian Government. Information Polity, 19(4), 351–368.

Kim, S., & Lee, J. (2012). E-participation, transparency, and trust in local government. Public Administration Review, 72(6), 819-828.

Lee, J., & Porumbescu, G. A. (2019). Engendering trust in government through e-government and administrative capacity. International Review of Administrative Sciences, 85(4), 779-798.

Lodge, M., & Wegrich, K. (2013). Governance as Learning: The Case of Transparency in European Union Policy Making. Governance, 26(2), 269–290.

Margetts, H., & Dunleavy, P. (2013). The second wave of digital-era governance: A quasi-paradigm for government on the Web. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society A: Mathematical, Physical and Engineering Sciences, 371(1987), 20120382.

Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. B. (2014). Designing Qualitative Research (6th ed.). Sage.

Meijer, A. J., Curtin, D., & Hillebrandt, M. (2016). Transparency in Public Administration: Conceptualizations, Outcomes, and Measurement. Public Administration Review, 76(3), 414–426.

Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2015). Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation (4th ed.). Jossey-Bass.

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook (3rd ed.). Sage.

Moon, M. J. (2002). The Evolution of E-Government among Municipalities: Rhetoric or Reality?. Public Administration Review, 62(4), 424–433.

Moore, M. H. (1995). Creating Public Value: Strategic Management in Government. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 16(1), 1-13.

OECD. (2017). Trust in government: Ethics measures in OECD countries. OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2020). The OECD digital government policy framework: Six dimensions of a digital

government. OECD Publishing.

Okoli, C. (2015). A guide to conducting a standalone systematic literature review. Communications of the Association for Information Systems, 37(43), 879-910.

Parent, M., Vandebeek, C. A., & Gemino, A. C. (2005). Building citizen trust through e-government. Government Information Quarterly, 22(4), 720-736.

Patton, M. Q. (2015). Qualitative Research & Evaluation Methods: Integrating Theory and Practice (4th ed.). Sage.

Piotrowski, S. J., & Van Ryzin, G. G. (2007). Citizen attitudes toward transparency in local government. The American Review of Public Administration, 37(3), 306-323.

Reddick, C. G. (2005). Citizen interaction with e-government: From the streets to servers? Government Information Quarterly, 22(1), 38-57.

Reddick, C. G., & Roy, J. (2013). Business perceptions and satisfaction with e-government: Findings from a Canadian survey. Government Information Quarterly, 30(1), 1-9.

Schaupp, L. C., & Carter, L. (2005). E-voting: From apathy to adoption. Journal of Enterprise Information Management, 18(5), 586-601.

Silverman, D. (2013). Doing Qualitative Research (4th ed.). Sage.

Stake, R. E. (1995). The Art of Case Study Research. Sage.

Thomas, J. C., & Streib, G. (2003). The new face of government: Citizen-initiated contacts in the era of e-government. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, 13(1), 83-102.

Tolbert, C. J., & Mossberger, K. (2006). The effects of e-government on trust and confidence in government. Public Administration Review, 66(3), 354-369.

United Nations. (2020). E-Government Survey 2020: Digital Government in the Decade of Action for Sustainable Development. United Nations.

Venkatesh, V., & Davis, F. D. (2000). A theoretical extension of the technology acceptance model: Four longitudinal field studies. Management Science, 46(2), 186-204.

Warren, M. E. (2017). The Power of Citizen Participation: Theories and Practices. Cambridge University Press.

Welch, E. W., Hinnant, C. C., & Moon, M. J. (2005). Linking Citizen Satisfaction with E-Government and Trust in Government. Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, 15(3), 371-391.

West, D. M. (2004). E-Government and the Transformation of Service Delivery and Citizen Attitudes. Public Administration Review, 64(1), 15-27.

Wong, W., & Welch, E. (2004). Does E-Government Promote Accountability? A Comparative Analysis of Website Openness and Government Accountability. Governance, 17(2), 275-

297.

Yang, K. (2005). Public administrators' trust in citizens: A missing link in citizen involvement efforts. Public Administration Review, 65(3), 273-285.

Yang, K., & Holzer, M. (2006). The performance–trust link: Implications for performance measurement. Public Administration Review, 66(1), 114-126.

Yin, R. K. (2018). Case Study Research and Applications: Design and Methods (6th ed.). Sage.